Equine Fatalities: Classifying Mechanisms of Injury and Use of Occult Hoof/Impact Pattern to Assist In Injury Classification

Kendall Von Crowns, M.D., Michelle Montonera, M.S., J. Keith Pinckard, M.D., Ph.D. and Adrienne Segovia, M.D.

History

- The earliest evidence of humans riding horses is 5,000-year-old fossils of worn-down horse teeth that indicate a riding bit was placed in the animal’s mouth.
- Saddle, and then the stirrup, first appeared in China ~ 2,000 years ago.
- The horse-loving Spaniards (word for “Gentleman” in Spanish is “caballero”, or “he who rides a horse”) introduced the horse to North America, with the first expeditions to Mexico after Christopher Columbus’s voyages.

Equidae Family

- Odd-toed ungulate mammals - horses and horse-like animals
  - Herbivores and grazers
  - Members
    - Horses
    - Donkeys
    - Mules
Horses
- Characteristics breed dependent
  - Over 350 known breeds
    - Divided into four groups
      - Light horses
      - Heavy horses
      - Ponies
      - Feral horses
  - Weight
    - 750 to 2,200 lbs.
  - Height
    - 56 to 76 inches (14-19 hands)
  - Speed
    - Average 40 mph
- Web/record: 55 mph

Donkeys
- Domesticated donkeys
  - Domesticated long before horses
  - Shorter, slower, unable to carry as much weight
  - Can pull heavier loads with greater ease
  - Differ from horses:
    - Relative to body size, larger heads and longer ears
    - Vary in size, depending on how bred
    - About 17 breeds
  - Weight
    - 400 to 500 lbs.
  - Height
    - 36 to 48 inches (hoof to shoulder)
  - Speed
    - 30 to 35 mph

Mules
- Do not occur naturally in the wild
  - Product of arranged couplings between male donkeys and female horses
  - Appear as larger, darker, more streamlined version of donkeys
  - Working animals
    - Patient, athletic, confident, easily trained, hardy
    - Different breed types
  - Weight
    - 820 to 1,000 lbs.
  - Height
    - 47 to 59 inches
  - Top speed
    - 15 mph
  - Sterile
Epidemiology

• United States has the most horses in the world
  – China
  – Mexico
  – Brazil
  – Argentina
  – Columbia

Epidemiology

• Most Horses by State
  1. Texas
  2. California
  3. Florida
  4. Oklahoma
  5. Kentucky
• Illinois is ranked 31st
• Rhode island has the fewest

Epidemiology

• 9.5 Million horses in the United States
  – 3% of population own horses in the U.S.
  – Recreational horse use is the largest segment of the horse industry

9.5 Million horses in the United States

– 3% of population own horses in the U.S.
– Recreational horse use is the largest segment of the horse industry
Equestrian Sports Injuries

- Rate of serious injuries
  - 1/350 for every 1000 hours spent riding
- Rate of major trauma
  - Up to 53.5 /100,000 participants per year
- Annual mortality
  - 1/1,000,000
  - Highest rate for all sports

Football
Ice Hockey
Motorcycle and automobile racing

Reason for Injuries

- Most Common reason reported
  - Horse Behavior
    - Unpredictable
    - “Spooking” is the most common cause
      - Prey animals
      - Constantly on the look out for whatever is out to get them
    - Startled
      - Buck/Bolt
      - Shy
      - Kick/stomp
      - Shove

Principle Mechanisms of Horse Related Injury

1. Fall
2. Kick
3. Crush
4. Strike an object while riding (i.e. tree branch)
5. Entangled in the stirrups
6. Entangled in the reins
7. Blow from the horse’s head
8. Step
9. Bite
Mechanism of Injury

- Fall
  - Rider’s head
    - 8 to 10 feet above ground
  - Direct fall from this height typically results in skull fractures unless rider is wearing a helmet

Mechanism of Injury

- Kick
  - Generally occurs when behind the horse
    - Cleaning/shoeing hoof
    - Checking a leg injury
    - Standing too close
    - Sexual intercourse with horse

Mechanisms of Injury

- Stepped on
  - Rider was either bucked off or the horse fell with the rider
    - Horse steps on the rider who is on the ground
    - As horse stands up – steps on the rider on the ground
  - Location of injuries
    - Range from crushing of head, torso and abdomen to fractures of the extremities
Reason For Kicks

- Illness/disease
  - Can change attitude resulting in acting out
- Sour attitude
  - Don't like repetition in their routine especially if pain is involved
- Pain
  - Back, hip, legs, hoof
  - Kicks out when manipulated
- Fear
  - Long memories with fear response of kicking
- Warning
  - Kicking a way of establishing dominance
- Playfulness
  - Sign they feel good or want to play

Kicks from Rear Legs

- Very Quick - little to no warning
- Three types
  - Forward
    - Toward belly
      - Associated with irritation (e.g., insect)
  - To the Side
    - "Cow Kicking"
    - Unexpected
  - Straight Back
    - Most power associated with

Force of Equine Kicks

- Horses
  - 8,000 to 10,000 Newtons
  - Force is equivalent to 1.8 times their body weight
- Donkeys
  - Not studied
- Zebras
  - Estimated 15,000 Newtons
Equine Related Injuries

- 1986 – 2018
  - Two Counties in the United States
    - Travis County, Texas
    - Cook County, Illinois
- 39 cases
  - Travis County: 21 cases
  - Cook County: 18 cases
  - Roughly 1 per year

TRAVIS COUNTY, TEXAS

- 1,023 sq miles
- Population: 1,024,266
- Population density: 1,034 /sq mile
- 5th most populous county
- Largest city: Austin
- County seat: Austin
- Medical Examiner’s Office contracts with 42 surrounding counties

Cook County, Illinois

- 5,530 sq miles
- Population: 5,194,675
- Population density 5,686 people/sq mile
- Largest county in Illinois
- 2nd largest county in the U.S.
Review of Equine Related Fatalities

• Male: Female
  - 23 Males
    • Travis County: 14
    • Cook County: 9
  - 16 Females
    • Travis County: 7
    • Cook County: 9

• Type of Equine
  - Horses: 38
    • Herd of Bulls: 1
  - Donkey: 1

• Mechanism of Injury
  - Falls: 62%
  - Kicks: 25%
  - Stepped on: 5%
  - Crushed: 6%
  - Getting on horse: 2%

• Activity
  - Riding: 79%
  - Grooming: 5%
  - Pitched/bucked: 5%
  - Intercourse with horse: 3%
  - Unknown: 8%

• Types of Injuries
  - Trauma to the head and neck – 68%
  - Trauma to the chest/abdomen – 27%
  - Trauma to the lower extremities – 5%

• Toxicology
  - Alcohol – 13%
  - Marijuana – 3%
  - Methamphetamine – 3%
  - Morphine – 3%
  - Negative – 36%
  - Not determined – 42%
Investigation

• Investigating these uncommon deaths is difficult
  – Unwitnessed
  – Partially Witnessed
  – In ranching situations there can be more than one equine and more than one hooved animal involved

• Differentiation of fall vs. kick can be difficult
  – Large irregular bruises
  – Internal injuries can look very similar
  – Recognition of hoof/impact pattern can be helpful

Investigation

• Hoof Print Can Be Matched to a Particular Animal
  – Hoof prints are unique among a species
  – Hoof prints are unique to an individual
  – Variety within the species

• Recognizing occult hoof/impact patterns in conjunction with the pattern of internal injuries can help determine if the incident occurred when the individual was mounted or unmounted

• 75 year old male found unresponsive in a pasture near a horse trailer

• Decedent was moderately decomposed

• No human witnesses to the incident
Patterned abrasion with surrounding bruising of the right side of the abdomen

Underlying the abrasion:
- Rib fractures
- Hemorrhage into the peritoneal cavity
- Lacerations of liver and mesentery
• Cause of Death: Blunt force injury of the chest and abdomen
• Manner of Death: Accident
• Bull was accused and sent to slaughter
• Arnold still roams free in the wilderness of Texas
• 25 year old white male found unconscious on ground of horse stall at racetrack where was formerly employed

• Was reportedly intoxicated and was found with his pants pulled down

• Taken by EMS to a local hospital and diagnosed with cerebral concussion and abdominal and intestinal injuries

• Underwent emergency surgery and later expired

“Choice Dancer”

Reportedly was attempting to have intercourse with the horse when he was kicked in the abdomen and either while collapsing, or on the ground was kicked in the head
• Autopsy:
  • External examination:
    • Lacerations of chin injuries of the head
    • Multiple bruises and abrasions on the chest, abdomen and lower extremities
    • One abraded area exhibited a horse shoe shape
  • Internal examination:
    • Diffuse subarachnoid hemorrhage
    • Fractures right side of mandible
    • Contusions of the mesentery and small intestines

• By comparing the horseshoe to the injury were able to determine that the decedent had been kicked by the horse

• Cause of Death: Cerebral injuries due to blunt trauma caused by a horse

• Manner of Death: Accident
• 57 year old white male
• Drinking with friends and stated wanted to “ride that horse”
• Witnesses agree he got on horse, but how injury occurred unclear – witnesses intoxicated
  – Bucked
  – Fell off horse
  – Struck head on a rock after fall or was kicked in the head after fall
• Transferred to hospital, diagnosed with skull fractures, subdural and subarachnoid hemorrhage
• Underwent a craniectomy and expired the following day

Autopsy:
External examination

Autopsy:
Internal examination

Subdural hemorrhage: Right cerebral convexity and trace over the left cerebral convexity
Subarachnoid hemorrhage: Bilateral cerebral convexities
Comparing prints of the hooves to the decedent’s wound pattern it was determined that decedent was kicked by the horse.

Cause of Death: Blunt head trauma

Manner of Death: Accident

**Conclusion**

- Correct classification of the injury mechanism
  - May provide useful information for injury prevention
    - Use/efficacy of protective equipment
  - Increase public awareness how injuries occur
    - Fall instruction: Release reins and roll away from animal